Benchmarking of the European and Ukrainian practice of applying a personalized approach to learning.

Presentation of the Report

Deliverable 2.1
Project Name: Students’ Personalised Learning Model, Based on the Virtual Learning Environment of Intellectual Tutoring
"Learning with No Limits" – SMART-PL
Grant Agreement No.: 101082928
May 25, 2023

Svitlana Kalashnikova,
Institute of Higher Education, NAES of Ukraine
Information about the authors

- The Report is prepared by the team of Institute of Higher Education, National Academy of Educational Science of Ukraine:
  - Svitlana Kalashnikova
  - Inna Vlasova
  - Olga Palamarchuk
  - Mariia Debych
  - Olena Lytorchenko

- Information for the Report was provided by:
  1. TALLINNA TEHNIKAÜLIKool: Madli Krispin
  2. KATHOLIEKE UNIVERSITEIT LEUVEN: Geert De Lepeleer
  3. POLITECHNIKA WROCŁAWSKA: Mariusz Mazurkiewicz
  4. IVAN FRANKO NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF LVIV: Olga Oseredchuk
  5. KRYVORIZKYJ NATIONALNYJ UNIVERSYTET: Tetiana Sulyma
  6. V. N. KARAZIN KHARKIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY: Olena Muradyan
  7. KHMELNITSKY NATIONAL UNIVERSITY: Tetiana Hovorushchenko
  8. ODESSA NATIONAL POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY: Marsym Maksymov
  9. INSTITUTE OF HIGHER EDUCATION OF THE NAESU: Iryna Drach, Olena Orzhel, Olena Slyusarenko
  10. KHERSON STATE UNIVERSITY: Yevhenia Revenko
Methodology (1)

The Report is prepared on the basis of:

- the information received from the European universities – Project’ partners (including information from the universities’ sites) about the practices of personalized learning (PL);
- the information from the Ukrainian universities – Project’ partners (including surveys of staff and students) to describe the current state / situation, to understand the existing gaps and to define the tasks for the process of implementing the Project.
Methodology (2)

Request to the European universities – Project’ partners was oriented to get information about their achievements in realization of PL in higher education including the following directions:

- Key features of the PL model in the university.
- Institutional policies and PL.
- Infrastructure, environment, tools, technologies, LMS, digitalization etc. for PL.
- University departments and staff responsible for PL.
- QA system in the university and PL.
- Students and PL: individual need; individual learning pathways / trajectories; elective courses / modules; formative assessment; support and tutoring; community of learners; engagement and active role in education process; collaboration with teachers; impact into study content and methods etc.
- University teachers and PL: innovative methods of teaching and learning; pedagogic strategies for PL; training and support for university teachers on PL; PL and personalized teaching (PT) etc.
- Management and PL: reflection, feedback, evaluation and decision-making on PL.
- Inclusion in education process.
- Other important experience.
Request to the Ukrainian universities – Project’ partners had 2 parts.

- the 1st – General questions about implementation of PL in the university;
- the 2nd – Questionnaire for surveying staff and students.
Tallinn University of Technology

- (1) General information about TalTech
- (2) Student Mobility
- (3) Student bodies
- (4) Counselling services
- (5) Study programmes
- (6) Engineering Pedagogy
- (7) Digitalization
- (8) Feedback
(1) Introduction
(2) Key features of the PL model in the university: the possible study paths
(3) Key features of the PL model in the university: The Individual Study Program (ISP)
(4) Institutional Policy and PL
(5) Infrastructure. Toledo
(6) University departments and staff responsible for PL
(7) KU Leuven Learning Lab
(8) Leuven Engineering & Science Education Center (LESEC)
(9) Quality assurance at KU Leuven and personalized learning
(10) Student evaluation
(11) Student evaluation in practice
(12) Students and Personalized Learning
(13) University teachers and Personalized learning
(14) Management and Personalized Learning
(15) Inclusion in education process
(16) Publications
Politechnika Wrocławska

- (1) Key features of the PL model in the university
- (2) Institutional policies and PL.
- (3) Infrastructure, environment, tools, technologies, LMS, digitalization etc. for PL
- (4) University departments and staff directly responsible for PL
- (5) QA system in the university and PL
- (6) Students and PL
- (7) University teachers and PL
- (8) Management and PL: reflection, feedback, evaluation and decision-making on PL
- (9) Inclusion in education process
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (1)

- # HEIs – 6
- # staff – 596
- # students – 1,189

Which of the following is implemented in the educational process of your HEI?

- Lectures-discussions
- Individual assignments / practical tasks
- Master classes with participation of professionals-practitioners
- Case studies / situational analyses
- Individual projects
- Group projects
- Individual research assignments
- Group research assignments
- Video lectures
- Virtual training equipment
- Digital laboratories
- E-training manuals
- Interactive textbooks / manuals / study guides
- Interactive games
- Virtual simulators
- Electronic tests
- Video lectures
- Group research assignments
- Individual assignments / practical tasks
- Lectures-discussions

[Bar chart showing implementation of different PL tools by students and academic staff]
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (2)

How are student individual educational / learning needs identified at your HEI?

- Anonymous inquiry / student survey
- Students’ requests submitted to a relevant university department
- Focus group survey
- Communicating requests to a course leader, group curator
- Individual educational / learning needs are not identified
- Difficult to answer
- Other (specify)

Students' and Academic staff's responses are shown in the bar chart.
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (3)

How are students informed about the content of elective courses at your HEI?

- The list of elective courses on HEI’s website
- Elective courses’ syllabi are available in open access on HEI’s
- Presentations of elective courses are available in open access on HEI’s website
- Presentations of elective courses are conducted directly by teachers who will teach the above courses
- Difficult to answer
- Other (specify)

Students
Academic staff
How are student individual learning pathways implemented at your HEI?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Academic staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students are offered elective courses only within the chosen educational / study programme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students are offered elective courses within other educational / study programmes of the same higher education level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elective courses are offered among different higher education levels within the HEI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students take courses at other HEIs within academic mobility programmes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students are offered compensatory courses – additional courses to improve students’ learning outcomes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social projects, volunteering as components of the educational / study programme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student internship / placement outside HEI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-the-job training as a dual form of higher education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning outcomes of MOOCs (open online courses such as Prometeus, Edx etc.) are recognized by the educational / study programme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to answer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (specify)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (5)

Does your HEI offer tests of different complexity levels depending on students’ educational / learning attainment?

- Yes
- No
- It is difficult to answer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Academic staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is difficult to answer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (6)

Which of the practices listed below are implemented in your HEI?

- Students are involved in the assessment / evaluation of teaching quality
- Students are involved in the development of educational / study programmes
- Students are involved in reviewing / updating of educational / study programmes
- Students are involved in defining the course content
- Students are involved in defining the assignments' content
- Students are involved in defining teaching and learning methods and techniques within a course
- Difficult to answer
- Other (specify)
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (7)

What types of support does your HEI provide to students to improve their learning outcomes, attainment?

- Tutors’ / curators’ support
- Individual consultations by teachers
- Organizational / instructional support provided by relevant HEI units or departments: Dean’s Office, Chairs, Academic Office etc.
- Psychological support by relevant university services
- Peer support provided by students
- Social support by relevant university services
- Difficult to answer
- Other (specify)

Students Academic staff
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine:
Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (8)

Which of the digital tools listed below does your HEI use to organize / support student learning?

- Individual student cabinet
- Digital student portfolio
- Digital class schedule
- Digital communication on the organization of educational process
- Digital performance / success record
- Digital survey on teaching quality
- Digital survey on the quality of organizational and instructional support
- Digital voting
- Difficult to answer
- Other (specify)

[Bar chart showing distribution of digital tools used by students and academic staff]
Implementation of PL in the universities of Ukraine: Questionnaire for surveying staff and students (9)

Which of the tools / methods / approaches listed below are used to assess students’ learning attainment at your HEI?

- Electronic self-assessment tests
- Peer assessment of learning outcomes – students assess other students
- 360-degree assessment method
- Psychological tests (to assess behavioural qualities acquired during learning)
- None of the above
- Difficult to answer

![Bar chart showing the use of assessment tools by students and academic staff.](chart.png)
Conclusions (1)

1. Institutional policies and PL.
   - PL is “sewn up” / embedded into most institutional policies, starting with university strategies and quality codes and ending with the regulations on mobility, individual pathways, elective courses etc.
   - The study did not reveal separate institutional policies directly targeted on PL.

3. University departments and staff responsible for PL.
   - PL is a task and responsibility of many and different university departments and staff.
   - Realization of PL in the university is the result of common efforts of different units and services as well as special responsible staff (tutors, curators, mediators, counsellors, facilitators etc.).
   - As a rule, Dean's Offices and Programme Directors consult students and provide the support on issues related to studies / a study programme.
6. University teachers and PL: innovative methods of teaching and learning; pedagogic strategies for PL; training and support for university teachers on PL; PL and personalized teaching (PT) etc.

- Universities support and motivate teachers to improve the teaching process with the focus on PL by development and implementation of innovative practices, pedagogical strategies and learner-centred teaching methods.
- Universities offer and develop a wide spectrum of services for the professional development of teachers on PL (including special units / centres/ labs, training programmes, initiatives, projects, competitions, researches, coaching, tutorial sessions, mentors, peer-to-peer support etc.)
Conclusions (3)

7. Management and PL: reflection, feedback, evaluation and decision-making on PL.

- Student evaluation of teaching, courses and organisation of studies is a regular and obligatory element of university life.
- Such feedback, on the one hand, reflects personalized opinions on university processes. At the same time, student feedback provides information for decision-makers on how to provide and improve PL.
- Results of student evaluation are recorded and taken into account in the staff portfolio.
- The European universities use educational data mining for providing information about the learning process and learner behaviour in design personalized learning systems.
8. Inclusion in education process.

- Inclusion in education process concerns the facilities for students with disabilities, special status and exceptional individual circumstances.

- Inclusion aims at creating a space to ensure that a student feels safe and completes the educational programme without unnecessary obstacles.

- Inclusion is provided by special infrastructure as well as special policies, procedures, support and culture.

- The European universities – partners of the Projects – have provided more specific and practically oriented information about implementation of inclusion in their universities. Information provided by Ukrainian partner universities is more general and formal.
9. Other important information

- The information obtained as a result of student and staff survey in the Ukrainian universities is of value and has to be taken into account by the concrete universities to improve their PL approach as well as at level of the Project implementation, in particular for organization of trainings for staff development.

- The survey showed that Ukrainian universities have a wide spectrum of policies, procedures, tools, methods, forms etc. to provide PL-approach in education process.

- But at the same time, the answers on request to describe specific practices, procedures, tools are quite general, formal and not specific. Another revealed contradiction is the significant differences in some of the answers of the students and the teachers. The mentioned facts may indicate the presence of certain problems that require additional clarification.
Thank you for your attention!

Contacts: T: +38 050 330 37 54
e-mail: s.kalashnikova@ihed.org.ua